

Table of Contents

Executive Summary

Abbreviations

Chapter 1 Status in Japan

Section 1 Overview of Tax Objections and Tax Tribunal

1. Tax Tribunal's Structural Change and Its Function
2. Data Analysis and Facts on Review at Tax Tribunal and Assessors
3. Data Analysis and Facts on Review at Court
4. Relationship between On-site Audits and the Number of Objections/Lawsuits Filed

Section 2 «Highly-Disputed Themes» of Direct Taxes at Tax Tribunal

1. Characteristics of «Highly-Disputed Themes» related to Income Tax Act (ITA)
 - (1) [Necessary expenses]
 - (2) [Salary, etc.] under [Withholding tax]
 - (3) [Re/assessment by estimation]
 - (4) [Income sourced in Japan]
 - (5) [Denial of a family company's actions or calculations]
 - (6) [Special credit for capital gains from the sale of resided property]/[Special credit for housing loans]
2. Characteristics of «Highly-Disputed Themes» of Corporate Income Tax Act (CITA)
 - (1) [Directors' remunerations, bonus, and retirement money]
 - (2) [Entertainment expenses, etc.]
 - (3) [Gratuitous transfer of monetary or economic benefits]
 - (4) [Business year to which taxable earnings/deductible expenses belong]
3. Characteristics of «Highly-Disputed Themes» related to Inheritance/Gift Tax Act (IGTA)
 - (1) [Principle of appraisal]
 - (2) [Rights and surface rights on land]
 - (3) [Scope of property subject to Inheritance Tax]
 - (4) [Deductible debt]

Section 3 «Highly-Disputed Themes» of Consumption Tax Act (CTA), AGRNT, and Collection Act

1. Characteristics of «Highly-Disputed Themes» related to CTA
 - (1) [Input tax credit]
 - (2) [Simplified taxation method]
 - (3) Tax-exempt transactions]
2. Attributes of «Highly-Disputed Themes» related to AGRNT
 - (1) [Refund request/Request for downward correction]
 - (2) [Justifiable reason] for a penalty exemption
 - (3) [Strict penalty] on concealment or fabrication of relevant facts
 - (4) Tax audit procedures
3. Attributes of «Highly-Disputed Themes» related to Collection Act
 - (1) Scope of administrative disposition
 - (2) Benefits of appeals/Standing to sue
 - (3) [Seizure]
 - (4) Suspension, etc. of collection action

Section 4. Main Triggers for Tax Disputes and Some Reform Proposals

1. Main Attributes of «Highly-Disputed Themes»

- (1) Opacity in the scope of application
 - (2) Exceptions and salvation
 - (3) Preferential treatments/tax incentives
2. Reform Proposals for Tax Dispute System and Procedures
- (1) Drastic reform of Tax Tribunal and "Proposal of flexible dispute resolution"
 - (2) "Proposal of preassessment dispute settlement"
3. "Proposal of Adopting Costs Shifting Rule"

Chapter 2 Status in the United States

Section 1. Tax Objections to Office of Appeals

1. Standard Objections Procedures and Office of Appeals' Function
2. Flexible Dispute Resolution
3. Recent New Developments at Office of Appeals
 - (1) Utilization of ADR and challenges
 - (2) "Taxpayer First Act" and expanded support measures for low-income disputants

Section 2 Tax Litigation in Court

1. Implications of Selecting Tax Court as a Litigation Forum
2. "Rule of not looking behind a Notice of Deficiency" and Nature of "90-Day Letter"
3. Characteristics of Dispute Resolution by Tax Court
4. Protection of Tax Litigation Rights of Taxpayers with Limited Means

Section 3 Rules on Attorney Fees

1. The "American Rule" and Its Metamorphosis
2. Differences/Similarities between Civil Rights Attorney Fees and Equal Access to Justice Act
3. Transformation of the "American Rule" in Tax Disputes
4. Further Developments on the "American Rule" in Tax Disputes

Section 4 Attributes of Most Litigated Tax Issues

1. Regulars on the Top 10 "Most-Litigated Issues"
2. Disputes on Penalty Issues
 - (1) Recent status of penalty issues
 - (2) Reasonable cause and its scope of application
3. Disputes on Collection Issues
4. Disputes on Innocent Spouse Issues
5. Disputes on Gross Income Issues and Trade or Business Expenses Issues
 - (1) Gross income issues
 - (2) Trade or business expenses issues

Section 5 Summary and Analysis

Chapter 3 Status in the United Kingdom

Section 1 Tax Objection Procedures

1. Tax Objection Procedures Before 2009 Reform

2. Tax Objection Procedures After 2009 Reform

Section 2 Flexible Tax Dispute Resolution

1. Basis and Scope of HMRC's Discretion for Flexible Dispute Resolution
2. Internal Controls for Flexible Dispute Resolution
3. Background and Procedures for Proactive Use of ADR

Section 3 Tribunals' Function and Performance

1. Classification of Appeal Cases
2. Rules on Costs Recovery at Administrative Stages

Section 4 Main Points of Issues on Tax Litigation

1. History and Rationale of the "English Rule" on Costs
2. Metamorphosis of the "English Rule"
3. Mitigation and Avoidance of Litigation Risk
4. Further Changes to the "English Rule"

Section 5 Characteristics of Highly-Disputed Issues

1. Disputes over Penalties
 - (1) Overview
 - (2) Criteria for imposing accuracy penalties and suspension of penalties
 - (3) Criteria for abating/suspending penalties on failure to file returns, etc.
 - (4) Relation between penalties and EU Law, etc.
2. Disputes over Business Expenses

Section 6 Summary and Analysis

Chapter 4 Status of Commonwealth Countries (Australia and NZ)

Section 1 Tax Dispute in Australia

1. Background and Effects of Reform of Tax Appeal System
2. Flexible Dispute Resolution
3. Disputes at AAT and Federal Court
 - (1) Advantages of appealing to AAT
 - (2) Advantages of filing lawsuits with Federal Court
4. Rules on Costs
 - (1) General rules
 - (2) Rules on costs in tax disputes
 - (3) Modification of the "Loser pays rule"
5. Highly-Disputed Themes
 - (1) Penalty cases
 - (2) "Deadline extension" cases

Section 2 Tax Dispute in NZ

1. Tax Objection Procedures and Their Characteristics
 - (1) New tax objection system and background for its introduction
 - (2) Dispute resolution under TAA Part 4A
2. Objections Filing with TRA and Its Processing
3. Commissioner's Discretionary Powers

- (1) Changes in her stance
 - (2) Their nature and current status
4. Rules on Costs

Section 3 Summary and Analysis

1. Summary and Analysis of Section 1
2. Summary and Analysis of Section 2

Chapter 5 Status of EU Member States (Ireland and Netherlands)

Section 1 Tax Dispute in Ireland

1. Tax Objection Procedures Before Its 2016 Revision
2. Current Tax Objection Procedures and Their Status
3. Flexible Resolution of Tax Disputes
4. Characteristics of Disputes over Penalties
5. Tax Litigations at Court and Impact of EU Law, etc.
 - (1) Impact of Article 6 of ECHR
 - (2) Impact of the Aarhus Convention

Section 2 Tax Dispute in the Netherlands

1. Tax Dispute Resolution Procedures and Current Status
 - (1) Objections and flexible dispute resolutions
 - (2) Tax litigation and its current status
2. Relationship with EU law
 - (1) Powers of the European Commission and the ECJ
 - (2) Relationship between Article 107 of TFEU and dispute settlement by agreement

Section 3 Summary and Analysis

1. Summary and Analysis of Section 1
2. Summary and Analysis of Section 2

Final Chapter: International Comparison and Options for Reform

Section 1 Key *Factors* Affecting the Number of Tax Disputes Abroad

1. Components of Key *Factors* and Their Status
2. U.S. Aspects of Key *Factors*
3. UK Aspects of Key *Factors*
4. Aspects of Key *Factors* in Australia and NZ
5. Aspects of Key *Factors* in Ireland and Netherlands

Section 2 Status of Key *Factors* Affecting the Number of Tax Disputes in Japan

1. On *Factor 1* (*tax structure*)
 - (1) Income tax (taxable unit, necessary expenses and blue return system)
 - (2) Inheritance tax (interaction with IT)
 - (3) Penalties
2. On the Other *Factors* (2 to 9)

Section 3 Pros and Cons of Some Reform Proposals for Tax Appeals Review Organs

1. Merits and Demerits of the “Proposal of transferring Tax Tribunal to the Cabinet Office”
2. Merits and Demerits of the “Proposal of Tax Court Establishment”

Section 4 Pros and Cons of Reform Proposals for Resolving Tax Disputes Flexibly

1. Merits and Demerits of the “Proposal of Flexible Dispute Resolution”
2. Merits and Demerits of the “Proposal of Review at Pre-Assessment Stage”

Section 5 Pros and Cons on “Loser pays rule”

1. Trends concerning Rules on Costs
2. Review of Costs Rules in Japan’s Tax Litigation

Epilogue

Attachment: Tax Tribunal’s Decisions published on its HP (2,594 as of 9/8/2022)

References (Chapter 1~Chapter 6)

List of referred decisions/rulings and their disputed points/themes